



UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI PALERMO

Working group on the 'European charter and code for researchers'

First internal biennial assessment **'Human Resources Strategy for Researchers Incorporating the Charter & Code'** Working document - University of Palermo, Italy

In the first two years of the project implementation, the working group has developed and followed many activities. Some of them are part of the strategic plan of the university of Palermo, other actions have been developed by the group itself supported by another group of administrative people. It must be here underlined that the actions have been supported by resources and people as decided by the current university board. Some other actions have not or only partially been implemented due to the changing regulatory framework in Italy and therefore many application decrees have not still been devised by the Ministry.

The most relevant actions are devoted to young researchers, PhD students and post-doc; they aim at

- 1) creating consciousness about the new situation in which the new generations of researchers are growing;
- 2) giving them tools to cope with the new challenges;
- 3) increasing the sense of belonging to the institution;
- 4) increasing the possibility to communicate with external actors (industry, EC, ...);
- 5) promoting incoming and outgoing mobility.

The last year has thus been employed to institutionalize the new actions set up. The attached tables is the revised action plan. As it is evident from the attached tables, many actions are still in progress because in 2010 a new law has changed the university system, most of the decrees putting in action the new law have not been issued, so Italy is actually in the middle of a strong change.

The actions that could actually be delivered by the institution have in many cases been carried out. For this reason, the action plan has not been enriched with new actions; the actions that had been set up in the first phase and that are still in progress are in a good number and must be carefully followed in their implementation.

Prof. Eleonora Riva Sanseverino
(Rector's delegate for the European charter and code for researchers)

Palermo, October 31st 2012

Table 2 – Human Resource Strategy for the University of Palermo

<u>C&C</u>	<u>Actions</u>	<u>Who</u>	<u>When</u>	<u>Results/current status</u>	<u>New actions</u>
ETHICAL AND PROFESSIONAL ASPECTS					
Researchers must be made aware of their role, of their responsibilities and of the operational constraints under which they work. There is the need for an ethical code which regulates and defines responsibilities in research (financial and social) also in order to avoid plagiarism and the infringement of IPR ¹ . Researchers must know the research institution's norms regards patents, the publication of research outputs, the development of new products....	<u>Dissemination to all researchers</u> of the ethical code elaborated by the Academic Senate regarding the themes of plagiarism, violation/request of patents and the protection guaranteed to industrial secrets.	Comunication Manager C&C Group	Done	http://portale.unipa.it/home/rice_rca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en The ethical code is published on the website http://www.unipa.it/~cdl/10codice%20etico.pdf	
Information regarding the aims of research activities must be made widely available throughout the research institution. Researchers must be aware of the people to whom they must report their research activities (tutors, lead investigators or fund providers)	<u>Dissemination to all researchers</u> of information regarding available funds for research activities and aims of the research carried out within each department.	Comunication Manager C&C Group	Done	http://portale.unipa.it/home/rice_rca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en Each department is now aware of the funding opportunities. The administration has also enrolled three experts to support the researchers for projects proposals.	
Researchers must render public data regarding the ways in which research funds are used. This data may be analyzed by internal/external organizations.				The national legislation imposes a regular control on public balances.	
Wide spread internal and external dissemination of research results also to an audience which is not specialized on the research institution's activities.	Completion of the English version of the University's web page. Creation of a specific technical-administrative office responsible for the management of the University's researchers visibility. The personnel belonging to this office should carry out the following specific	Comunication Manager University Governance Bodies	In progress New deadline march 2013	Currently, the information related to foreign students are available in English. There is a group of technicians and communication experts working on a big restructuring of the website. The new website should	

¹ Intellectual Property Right

	<p>activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * regular up-date of a section of the University's web page which illustrates the most relevant research activities carried out in the University (University labs; research projects etc.); * maintain and regularly up-date the researcher's personal Italian and English web pages 			<p>appear before march 2013.</p> <p>The new website also includes the possibility to visualize each page of the site in other languages.</p>	
<p>The research institution's fund providers or governance bodies must identify mechanisms according to which research outputs may be periodically evaluated through a transparent process carried out by an independent organism (which should preferably be international for the evaluation of senior researcher activities)</p>	<p>The evaluation of research activities and outputs should always be carried out by independent committees</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>Done</p>	<p>Through the Italian national research evaluation agency ANVUR</p>	
RECRUITMENT (Dimension 1)					
<p>Research Institutions or the bodies funding research should guarantee that the prerequisites to access the scientific research career are clearly defined.</p> <p>They should facilitate both the access to the scientific research career to disadvantaged groups and the return of faculty who is currently abroad.</p>	<p>Encourage the adoption of "open" selection procedures which must be widely publicized in English so as to permit the access to the research career (doctoral programme) also on behalf of foreign students.</p> <p>Establish entrance examinations for doctoral programmes in English and clearly pre-define the rules of the selection process in the call for applications.*</p>	<p>Governance bodies of the University</p>	<p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p>	<p>Calls are published on the Euraxess portal http://ec.europa.eu/euraxess/index.cfm/jobs/index</p> <p>A reservation of scholarships for foreign students is provided</p> <p>Calls are published on the Euraxess portal http://ec.europa.eu/euraxess/index.cfm/jobs/index</p>	
<p>Recruitment of researchers should be carried out following procedures which are open, efficient, transparent, useful and internationally comparable. Such procedures must allow to select the profiles required. An adequate amount of time must be guaranteed between the publicity of the public selection for researcher positions and the deadline to submit applications.</p>	<p>Publish the call for applications to the selection processes for doctoral programmes on the Euraxess web platform.</p>				
<p>Selection committees must be varied and guarantee equilibrium amongst genders; where possible they should include people</p>	<p>Where allowed by the current law (MURST regulations for PhD courses(1999) art.5 'Access' and Chancellor Decree n.</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>In progress</p>	<p>The ministry should issue by the end of 2012 with an operative decree focused on PhD courses.</p>	

<p>from different sectors (public/private). Each selection process may choose the evaluation method(s) to be adopted (interview, oral examination, external evaluations on behalf of external sector experts, etc.)</p>	<p>4283/2009 – Regulations for the PhD) enrich the selection committees with members that come from other Universities and/or from other public/private research institutions (e.g. the CNR – the Italian National Research Council) and/or from firms.</p>	<p>University Governance bodies</p>		<p>According to Law 240/2010 new ministerial and academic regulations on doctoral programs and selection committees will be issued. Currently the access to associate and full professor positions are evaluated by commissions including foreign experts. No attention is paid to gender issues and to the inclusion of people coming from different sectors (public/private) within selection committees.</p>	
<p>Candidates should be made aware of their career prospects and their strengths and weaknesses should be communicated to them before the selection process begins</p>		<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>Done</p>	<p>New regulations governing the academic careers were introduced by Law n.240/2010. In the last months a few operative norms have been presented, while some more are still waited in the next weeks focused on the exams to access professorships of first and second level.</p> <p>An e-mailing dissemination system is active both in the whole University and inside the Department through the Directors, aimed to let young researchers know the evolutions of the laws governing Universities in such a period of strong changes with specific reference to academic careers. What is more all the news about Italian laws can be find out in the University web site (http://www.unipa.it/~cdl/wall91.htm) and in the Ministry one (http://attiministeriali.miur.it/)</p>	
<p>The selection process should consider the</p>	<p>Modify current recruitment procedures</p>	<p>Ministry of Education,</p>	<p>In progress</p>	<p>Such procedure is almost</p>	

<p>entire background of all candidates, and take into particular consideration their potential, creativity and level of independence. Candidates' merit must be evaluated both on a quantitative and qualitative basis: avoiding to limit the analysis only to the number of publications and bibliometric indices, but also teaching skills, capacity to work in groups, and ability to transfer knowledge. In the case of candidates who come from industrial sectors, their contribution to patents or innovations must be evaluated.</p>		<p>University and Research</p>		<p>operative as far as the bibliometric fields of research are regarded. Humanities and other non-bibliometric areas do not always consider objective numerical indicators within the recruitment procedures. The application decrees of the new law 240/2010 are going to be issued. They will rule the criteria through which candidates will be selected.</p>	
<p>Interruptions or variations in career paths must not be penalizing, rather they should be considered as potentially enriching experiences for the professional development of the candidate</p>	<p>Elaboration of norms concerning the compatibility with external roles and collaborations</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>Dependent on external actors</p>	<p>Interruptions are not considered useful for the careers development by legislation. External activity for professors is strictly ruled and rarely possible.</p>	
<p>All experiences connected to the candidates' interdisciplinary, international or intersectoral mobility should be considered as a contribution to the professional development of the researcher.</p>	<p>Change the rules for the selection of researchers</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>Done</p>	<p>The new regulation regarding researcher recruitment takes into account the "mobility" aspect. What is more the 20% of the total amount of the resources for recruitment and upgrades of researchers and professors must be dedicated by each University to "external" people, namely people coming from other Universities. Also the most recent "Decreto della Programmazione" (DECRETO LEGISLATIVO 29 marzo 2012, n. 49) describes the ways the Universities will be "ex-post" evaluated regarding the recruitment policies.</p>	
<p>Post-doc researchers should be recruited only on a temporary basis, with the specific aim to foster further opportunities of professional development within a long term research career</p>	<p>Encourage the elaboration of stabilization policies Conduct careful planning of the human resources necessary and sustainable in time</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research University Governance Bodies</p>	<p>dependent on external actors</p>	<p>Such action is limited by the reduced turn over characterizing the academia in Italy. The most recent "Decreto della Programmazione" (DECRETO</p>	

				<p>LEGISLATIVO 29 marzo 2012, n. 49) describes the ways the Universities must plan their recruitments every three years. This aspect is very delicate since it was dealt with internally by each department. Currently not all the required decrees have been issued.</p> <p>So the new rules for HR planning will be afterwards implemented</p>	
WORK CONDITIONS AND SOCIAL SECURITY (2nd sphere e 3rd Sphere)					
All researchers must be treated as professionals as of their entrance to the doctoral programme	Envolvement of doctoral and post-doc students in the Universitys' activities.	C&C Group	Done	http://portale.unipa.it/home/rice/rca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en	
The research setting must be stimulating and formative. Safety must be guaranteed on work premises and in research settings.	Where necessary, modify laboratories, lecture halls and research areas in order to abide current norms and rules regarding work conditions and safety.	Ministry of Education, University and Research University Governance bodies Department Heads Laboratory Responsibles	dependent on external actors	Investments depend on the current unfavourable economic conditions and funds transfer from the central national administration. Nevertheless, many teaching infrastructures have been renovated.	
Work conditions for researchers, including the physically challenged, must be sufficiently flexible to sustain positive outcomes of research endeavours. Such conditions should allow to render compatible work and family, children and career. Amongst the specific aspects to be taken into consideration there are, for example: flexible work hours, possibility to work part-time, distance working, sabbaticals...	Invest in the increase of structures aimed to support the physically challenged and women workers. Increase transport through bus services which connect the centre of town to the university structures, create nurseries, extend parental leave rights also to post-docs.	University Governance bodies Municipality of Palermo	Done dependent on external actors	City mobility infrastructures are going through major renovations. In Italy the welfare is currently supported largely from families. No parental rights have been extended to post-docs. In most cases researchers cannot get sabbaticals, because of teaching commitments. The university of Palermo on its side has: 1) Created In the university campus, a medical assistance point for all students who need medical assistance. There students can have blood exams and visits from different	

				specialists coming from the university hospital. http://portale.unipa.it/amu/2)Created a nursery open to professors, reserachers, administrative units.	
Funding agencies or research institutions should guarantee that research performance will not suffer the influence of unstable work conditions. <i>EU directive on fixed term work</i>	Stabilization of fixed term researchers	Ministry of University and research	In progress	Due to the new incoming laws and regulations, the next years will be characterized by strong changes and evolutions. Overall the current budget condition of each single University will determine the careers of the researchers. At the University of Palermo, some stabilizations of the fixed term researchers will be considered in the next months, since the first new fixed term contracts are about to conclude. What is more, in the already cited "Decreto della Programmazione" (DECRETO LEGISLATIVO 29 marzo 2012, n. 49) some regulations regarding the so-called 'tenure track' procedure are given.	
Funding agencies or research institutions should guarantee reasonable researchers' wages and work conditions. Further, they should guaratee that work conditions and safety measures abide by law and University regulation requirements.	Increase research wages to the levels obtained by other European researchers.	Ministry of Education, University and Research	dependent on external actors	The new law 240/2010 links the increase of wages to research productivity, but still there are no actuation decrees on the topic. Due to the economical crisis since a few years public employees do not get any salary increase.	
	Connect the entity of doctoral and post-doc grants to the quality and quantity of scientific research outputs obtained by each researcher, as of the second year of the doctoral programme.* Establish economic reward systems for single researchers or groups of researchers who's scientific research outputs are of particular	Ministry of Education, University and Research University governance bodies	dependent on external actors	The new law 240/2010 links the increase of wages to research productivity, but still there are no actuation decrees on the topic. A new regulation for internal fundings for research distribution has been issued. New internal	

	relevance at the national and international level.			fundings will be delivered considering merit following more strict criteria concerning fund raising capacities/potential	
Funding agencies or research institutions should guarantee an equilibrium between genders at all levels and in all governance and management bodies.	Guarantee adequate female gender representation in the University's governance bodies	University governance bodies Ministry of Education, University and Research	Done	Such issue is mentioned in the new Italian regulation on academic careers. In the new Statute of the University designed according to the new Law 240/2010, it is required gender balance in some of the governance bodies.	
Funding agencies or research institutions should engage in the elaboration of career paths for all the professional research profiles (HRS) present in the organization through the use of mentoring and tutoring.	Motivate and monitor research re-qualification and up-date at all stages of researchers' career. Extending education for teaching, fund raising and research to all those who make request for it.	Single research coordinators Research Dept. and C&C group	Done Done	Such issue is typically demanded to each single research groups and teams. Currently there is an educational program involving young researchers which is regularly run.	
Funding agencies or research institutions should must consider all experiences connected to the candidates' interdisciplinary, international or intersectoral mobility as a contribution to the professional development of the researcher. Thus these types of mobility should be encouraged and be taken into specific consideration within the career progression evaluation procedures.	Open graduate degrees and doctoral programmes internationally (see table 3) – professors should be allowed to teach in English, Italian or French as they please, at least in those degrees in which one or more foreign language must be studied.	Ministry of Education, University and Research University governance bodies	Done Done	This action is mostly implemented for PhD students, while it is still in progress for degrees. Some degree courses are now taught in English, mostly in scientific fields.	
Funding agencies or research institutions should guarantee researchers access to work opportunities at all stages of their career.	Encourage and reward virtuous relationships with enterprises.	University governance bodies	Done	UniPA participates with a private partner in a consortium (ARCA) for the support of research based spin off enterprises. http://www.conorzioarca.it/index.php?option=content&task=view&id=138&Itemid=154	
Funding agencies or research institutions	Enhance the capacity of the patent office in	University	Done	It should be noticed that in Italy	

<p>should motivate researchers at all stages of their career in their endeavours to produce innovations and obtain patents through the guarantee of an adequate legal protection of IPRs.</p>	<p>order to increase the support offered to researchers for the protection of the IPRs they contribute to create.</p>	<p>governance bodies</p>		<p>there is a strong difference in the patenting approach depending on the specific University. At the University of Palermo a supporting action has been already started through the International Liason Office of the University of Palermo. The latter office has gained visibility through seminars and dissemination activity within the university.</p>	
<p>Co-authorship should be considered positively.</p> <p>Specific policies and strategies should be elaborated to diffuse a working environment in which being acknowledged through scientific citations (or other such signals) conveys benefits to the researcher.</p>	<p>Raise consciousness in researchers about the importance of being acknowledged through scientific citations.</p>	<p>C&C group, Research department</p>	<p>Done</p>	<p>Co-authorship is considered positively only when the co-author is a foreign author. Such element is also important because Scimago indicators are considered for the ranking of the University. The latter issue is one of the topic of dissemination carried out by the C&C group.</p>	
<p>Where norms permit, procedures aimed to assist and resolve conflicts in the work place (especially for those who are at the initial stages of their careers) should be elaborated.</p>	<p>Recruit one administrative employee per department whose role is to offer counselling regards social security norms.</p> <p>Recruit one administrative employee per department whose role is to resolve work related litigations, with particular attention to the necessity of the young researchers.</p>	<p>University governance bodies</p>	<p>Not done</p> <p>Not done</p>	<p>Social security norms concerning pension rights are considered an important topic during the education program of young researchers.</p> <p>There is not a large interest in the issue at governmental level, thus such scarce interest is reflected at local level on university governance bodies</p>	<p>Social security norms concerning pension rights are an important topic within the education program of young researchers (Done).</p>
<p>Teaching is an essential means to structure and disseminate knowledge and, therefore, must be considered an important aspect of a researchers' career. However, teaching duties must not be excessive or compromise research performance.</p>	<p>Offer teaching technique courses for the professors and researchers of the University.</p> <p>Offer third level education courses – i.e. structured doctoral programmes and courses (see Table 3)*</p>	<p>University governance bodies</p> <p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>Done</p> <p>dependent on external actors</p>	<p>Training for Teaching is one of the issues of the educational program in the university. The course is also open to professors and young researchers who want to join.</p> <p>The national legislation does not rule the education at PhD level.</p>	

Researchers must have a sufficient number of representatives in all governance and management bodies of the University.	Increase the participation of doctoral and post-doc students to the governance bodies of the university.	University governance bodies	Done	The UNIPA internal regulations include, where possible, doctoral and post-docs within governance bodies.	
TRAINING (4th sphere)					
During their education, researchers should have a structured relationship with their supervisors in order to gain full advantage from these academic ties.	Offer third level education courses – i.e. structured doctoral programmes and courses (see Table 3).*	Ministry of Education, University and Research University governance bodies	dependent on external actors	In progress on a voluntary basis. Its implementation depends on the national legislation which do not rule the education at PhD level.	
Senior researchers should be aware of the multifaceted role they play and create the conditions for an effective knowledge transfer to the younger researchers.	Raise more consciousness on the topic in senior researchers involving them in teaching activities even after their retirement.	University governance bodies	Done	When possible retired professors are employed in teaching activities and mentoring for research.	Mentoring in mobility activities and european project activities also through the help experienced professors.
Researchers at all levels should enhance their level of expertise and up-date their knowledge on a continual basis. Research institutions should strongly support all activities fostering research up-date.	Offer structured seminar programmes for post-doc researchers and doctoral programmes and courses. The research and development department enrolls a few experts that will help the applicants to European funds. Encourage the development and increase the fruition of services of the University's Language Centre as well as of the other pooled resources and structures in order to up-grade the common knowledge base and obtain technical/linguistic support when necessary.	University governance bodies	Done Done	Courses and seminars are offered to PhD students and LT researchers http://portale.unipa.it/home/rice_rca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en Different level english courses are offered to PhD students	
Funding agencies or research institutions should control that supervisors have the sufficient time and capacity to offer effective tuition and guidance to the your researchers who work with them.				It is demanded to each researcher's will and there is no real control on such activity.	

*Ph.D. schools are not recognized by the Ministry and full legislation on the issue is not yet available. Also selection procedures and final examinations are mostly ruled by national laws. An applicative law is waited by the end of 2012, describing the accreditation procedures for the PhD courses all over Italy.

Human Resource Strategy for the University of Palermo – Young Researchers Strategy Plan

<u>C&C</u>	<u>Actions</u>	<u>Who</u>	<u>When</u>	<u>Results/current status</u>
<p>To involve young part-time researchers in the University's activities</p> <p>'Researchers must be conscious of their status, their responsibility and of the constraints imposed by the working environment. An ethical code is required to define research boundaries, in order to avoid plagiarism and the infringement of intellectual property rights (IPR)'</p>	<p>Establish meetings aimed at different researchers categories (Ph.D. students, post-doc research fellows) to stimulate internal debate about the peculiar needs of different research areas (e.g. Social sciences vs. natural sciences) and about the problems of different job positions.</p> <p>Effective disclosure of European Charter of Research principles and C&C survey results</p> <p>Disclosure of data on doctoral students in Europe (e.g. Post-doc employment rate) and on post doc opportunities (with reference to institutions like the European University Association).</p> <p>Dissemination among the researchers of the significance and importance of research evaluation tools, taking in account different research areas peculiarities</p> <p>Dissemination of information about pension rights and complementary pension systems</p>	<p>University Communication Staff</p> <p>C&C Group</p>	<p>Done</p>	<p>Institutional courses and seminars are delivered yearly to Ph.D students and post-doc researchers</p> <p>Please check the website to see which courses have been delivered</p> <p>http://portale.unipa.it/home/ricerca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en</p>
<p>Funding agencies and research institutions should reward geographic, inter-sector and interdisciplinary mobility for the development of scientific and professional career paths.</p> <p>Mobility should also be supported and recognized in career evaluation systems.</p>	<p>Modify doctoral student selection criteria in order to allow interested private sponsors to participate in the process.*</p> <p>Link doctoral courses' research themes to industrial and commercial needs of the region</p> <p>Establish a compulsory research period abroad in public or private research institutions during Ph.D. courses.</p> <p>Consider research periods abroad in the researchers' selection process and for career path developments</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research (MIUR)</p> <p>University Governance Bodies</p> <p>Ministry of Education, University and Research (MIUR)</p>	<p>dependent on external actors</p> <p>Done</p> <p>In progress</p> <p>Done</p>	<p>In technical areas there is a string connection between university and industry due to the indirect access fundings from the EU.</p> <p>Research fundings are not sufficient to cover a compulsory research period abroad, but there is a strong will to do it.</p> <p>The new selection criteria for permanent positions consider experience abroad as a fundamental element</p>

	<p>Cut costs for researchers visiting Palermo University. Draw up an agreement with ERSU to allow Ph. D. students to receive campus services, without additional fees: e.g. campus room and board, shop discounts computer use. They should also get discounts on university registration fees.</p> <p>Create a dedicated website where researchers who have worked abroad can share their experience and help the ones who are going to spend a research period abroad.</p> <p>Reform the University Mobility Department in order to satisfy the needs of both foreign and Italian students who are considering moving to the University of Palermo.</p>	University Governance Bodies	<p>Done</p> <p>In progress</p> <p>In progress</p>	<p>Specific agreements are implemented for visiting students from different foreign universities</p> <p>The web site of the University of Palermo is still under revision, the new website will host a wide personal section. So maybe this action will not be needed anymore.</p> <p>Several actions of hospitality already started regarding for instance the accommodation of the foreign students. A welcome office exists and it should be soon enlarged.</p>
<p>Researchers at all career stages should seek to continually improve themselves by regularly updating and expanding their skills and competencies</p>	<p>Plan lectures (involving both doctoral students and post-doc research fellows) on interesting general topics about research (bibliometrics, intellectual property rights and plagiarism)</p> <p>Some of the lectures should include several topics aimed (primarily) at Ph.D. students: bibliographic research and state-of-the-art description; how to write a scientific paper; how to write a monograph; conference presentation techniques; etc.</p> <p>Other lectures should include several topics aimed (primarily) at post-doc research fellows: lecturing techniques; student examination techniques; how to write a research project; research funding opportunities in Sicily, Italy and Europe.</p>	<p>University Governance Bodies and University Communication Staff and C&C Group</p>	Done	<p>Institutional courses and seminars are delivered yearly to Ph.D students and post-doc researchers</p> <p>Please check the website to see which courses have been delivered</p> <p>http://portale.unipa.it/home/ricerca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=en</p>

	<p>Plan doctoral courses according to “Processo di Bologna” principles by assigning 180 compulsory credits for three years courses. The credits should be verified by periodic examination and by a final dissertation. The rearrangement of the doctoral courses should also influence lecturers and professors institutional duties (e.g. by weighting teaching assignments with number of students).*</p> <p>Present doctoral students to both local and national private and public institutions in order to promote the competencies they have acquired during the course. This should support formal acknowledgement of doctoral degrees.</p> <p>Involve post-doc research fellows by supporting them in research funding acquisition with a dedicated University department.</p> <p>Include in doctoral courses:</p> <p>a) Final examination in English</p> <p>b) An English professor should be included in the final examination committee*</p> <p>Once established, the Board of Ph.D. schools will decide Ph.D. student’s evaluation criteria both during the course and at the final stage.*</p> <p>Ph.D. Schools external evaluation committee should also be instituted.*</p>	<p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p> <p>University Communication Staff</p> <p>C&C Group</p> <p>Ministry of Education, University and Research</p>	<p>dependent on external actors</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>dependent on external actors</p>	<p>There is a consortium ARCA supporting spin-off enterprises started by young researchers</p> <p>Institutional courses and seminars are delivered yearly to Ph.D students and post-doc researchers Please check the website to see which courses have been delivered http://portale.unipa.it/home/ricerca/cartaeuropearicercatori/index.html?_setlocale=-en</p> <p>Ph.D. students are free to choose the final examination language</p> <p>A foreign Professor is included in the final commission only in the case of the ‘Doctor Europaeus’ title, and the exam is carried out in English language.</p> <p>Very few PhD courses have an external evaluation committee monitoring the activity of both the students and the board members.</p>
--	---	--	---	--

	Doctoral courses final examination results should be primarily considered for post-doc job assignment at the research institution.	University Governance Bodies	Done	It is included in the selection criteria in order to get a limited time researcher position.
Research evaluation and reward	Post-doc research fellows and part-time assistant professor performance should be evaluated on a regular basis and that should affect their career development	University Governance Bodies Ministry of Education, University and Research	In progress dependent on external actors	At the moment post doc fellows ('assegnisti di ricerca') are evaluated at the mid term of their potential contract time by the Academic Senate. The new law 240/2010 links the increase of wages to research productivity, but still there are no actuation decrees on the topic.

*Ph.D. schools are not recognized by the Ministry and full legislation on the issue is not yet available. Also selection procedures and final examinations are mostly ruled by national laws.